

APPALACHIAN COMMUNITY CAPITAL

IN PARTNERSHIP WITH PROGRAM SPONSORS



REQUEST FOR PROPOSAL (“RFP”) FOR OPPORTUNITY APPALACHIA PROJECT TECHNICAL ASSISTANCE

Project Sponsor: City of Youngstown, Youngstown, Ohio

Project Name: City of Youngstown Parking Garage Financial Feasibility Study (Project Summary provided in Attachment B.)

Release Date: June 14, 2022
Proposal Due Date: July 12, 2022
Selection Date: July 19, 2022
Contract Period: July 19, 2022 – February 28, 2023 (or later)

REQUEST FOR PROPOSALS

Technical Assistance for Opportunity Appalachia Projects

I. Overview of Request for Proposals

Appalachian Community Capital (ACC) seeks contractual support for specified Technical Assistance for real estate project development.

The Technical Assistance contractor will report to the Program Manager of Opportunity Appalachia. The requested Scope of Services is noted in Attachment A, and may involve:

- Architectural and engineering,
- Market research/demand assessment,
- Development of investment prospectus, preparation of pro forma financial projections, structuring of projecting financing,
- Feasibility assessment,
- Identification of project developers and/or business operators,
- Investor outreach for project finance/investment,
- And other types of support.

Entities interested in providing Technical Assistance must complete the Request for Qualifications RFQ, as noted on the [Opportunity Appalachia](#) webpage and found [here](#). Proposals will be evaluated on contractors' qualifications (per the RFQ), expertise, track record, Scope of Work, budget/timeline, and other project requests.

II. About Opportunity Appalachia

[Opportunity Appalachia](#) will provide technical assistance to develop and structure investable transactions, and it will create investment prospectuses and pitch decks that will be used to bring investment to rural and downtown communities. Investment priorities include projects focusing on downtown development, manufacturing, IT, healthcare, education, food systems, clean energy, heritage tourism, and recreation.

The program recently announced selection of 34 projects to participate in the program to bring jobs, business support, and investment to Central Appalachia. The selected projects propose to create over 1,600 permanent and 190 construction jobs and attract over \$177M in financing to develop textile manufacturing facilities; downtown development; community centers; health, wellness, and childcare centers; food and agricultural facilities; hotels; and retail enterprises in downtown and rural areas across Central Appalachia.

These proposed projects are signals of the growing investment potential in our rural and downtown communities in Central Appalachia. Opportunity Appalachia will work closely with private investors, banks, Community Development Financial Institutions, New Markets Tax Credits investors, Historic Tax Credit Investors, and Federal and State agencies to highlight participating communities and access financing for transactions.

Once project technical assistance is completed, a highly visible Investor Convening event will be held in early 2023 that will target both local and pre-vetted national investors, as well as federal and state funders. A curated web-based platform hosting prospectus / pitch decks will also be made available to facilitate investor due diligence.

The program is supported by the Appalachian Regional Commission, the US Department of Treasury CDFI Fund, Truist, Goldman Sachs, and the Dogwood Health Trust.

III. About the Appalachian Region

The Appalachian Region, as defined in ARC's authorizing legislation, is a 205,000 square-mile region that follows the spine of the Appalachian Mountains from southern New York to northern Mississippi. It includes all of West Virginia and parts of 12 other states: Alabama, Georgia, Kentucky, Maryland, Mississippi, New York, North Carolina, Ohio, Pennsylvania, South Carolina, Tennessee, and Virginia. Forty-two percent of the Region's population is rural, compared with 20 percent of the national population.

The Appalachian Region's economy, which was once highly dependent on extractive industries, has become more diversified in recent times and now includes larger shares of manufacturing and professional services, among other industries. Appalachia has made significant progress over the past five decades: its poverty rate, which was 31 percent in 1960, had fallen to 16.3 percent over the 2013– 2017 period. The number of high-poverty counties in the Region (those with poverty rates more than 1.5 times the U.S. average) declined from 295 in 1960 to 98 over the 2013–2017 period.

These gains have transformed the Region from one of widespread poverty to one of economic contrasts: some communities have successfully diversified their economies, while others still require basic infrastructure such as roads, clinics, and water and wastewater systems. The contrasts are not surprising considering the Region's size and diversity—the Region extends more than 1,000 miles from southern New York to northeastern Mississippi, and it is home to more than 25 million people.

Target geography

Central Appalachia – North Carolina, Ohio, Tennessee, Virginia, West Virginia



IV. Project Timeline

It is anticipated that the contractor will be selected by July 15, 2022 for an estimated contract start date of July 15, 2022 through February 28, 2023.

V. Instructions to Submit a Proposal

Contractors seeking to provide the full suite of TA services should submit the items listed below. It is expected that one proposal should include all requested services, which may mean that multiple entities are providing services, with one identified lead contractor.

- Scope of Work (max 3 pages) describing proposed activities to be undertaken as requested in Attachment A, with identified staffing (lead and support) for each work element.
- Budget that defines deliverables, rates and proposed payment schedule including indirect costs. A Not to Exceed cost for the full engagement must be provided; costs not to exceed \$75,000. Payment Schedule to be based on deliverables / outcome milestones.
- Timeline for Scope of Work, with deliverable milestones.
- Biography/resume for all staff noted in proposal (or provided in RFQ response).
- References from current or prior clients, including name, title, organization, contact information, and a brief description of the relevant work performed (or provided in RFQ response).

Please submit responses via email in one pdf attachment by Proposal Due Date to Kathryn Coulter Rhodes oa@acc1.org.

VI. Proposal Evaluation

ACC will select contractors through a competitive process based on the following criteria.

- Qualifications (per those provided in the RFQ), expertise, track record, and staff bios.
- Scope of Work and Timeline
- Budget
- Requests from project sponsors

Attachment A

Requested Scope of Services

Project Sponsor: City of Youngstown

Project Name: City of Youngstown Parking Garage Financial Feasibility Study

Project Summary provided in Attachment B.

TA Requested

- Parking Garage Financial Feasibility Study to test the design and cost assumptions of an existing Parking Garage Design Study. The feasibility study should include:
 - Market analysis for off-street parking to meet the demand identified by the existing Parking Garage Design Study
 - Confirm the existing and future demand for parking and its availability in the proposed garage site
 - Determination of the ideal number of parking spaces for the subject parking garage
 - Determination of the financial feasibility and sustainability of a market-supported parking structure in the specified location.
 - Explore feasibility of complementary uses to support clean energy and green water retention options.
 - Explore feasibility and economic value of ground level, sidewalk-facing retail and/or public sector uses.
 - Engage local businesses and tenants in Study preparation
- Operating plan to include operating expenses, parking rate structure, and fare collection technology
- Capital structuring to include
 - Identification of proposed sources and uses of funds
 - Assessment of public-private partnerships / ownership structure
 - Preparation of a 10-year operating pro forma

Attachment B

Summary Information

Lead Contact: Hunter Morrison

Applicant Organization: City of Youngstown

Address: 26 S. Phelps Street, Youngstown, Ohio 44503

Phone: (216) 410-7698

Email: hmorrison@youngstownohio.gov

Community Information

1. Communities targeted by this application (municipality(ies), county(ies), and census tract(s):
Note: See Appendix I for a list of eligible counties.

Youngstown, Mahoning County is the project location. Census tract 813700.

2. Service area of applicant (note if different than above, or note same): same
3. Community Development Strategy(ies): The need for dedicated off street parking is recognized in the Downtown Vision and Action Plan (2015), Youngstown's adopted community development strategy for its downtown central business district. Initiative 6 of the Plan states that "accessible and convenient parking is necessary for economic development" and establishes as an objective for its Parking Management Initiative "connecting the downtown and YSU campus through a well-lit, maintained, welcoming and centralized parking option for users of downtown and the campus in order to avoid demolition for surface parking." The Plan calls for preparing a feasibility study for shared parking facilities to serve both the downtown and the university. The proposed financial feasibility study for the Commerce Street garage located between the campus and the downtown addresses the Plan's objectives. Building a parking structure frees scattered surface lots for infill development --a more productive use of business district space. The City of Youngstown has invested millions of public dollars in upgrading infrastructure, supporting redevelopment projects, and building public venues for entertainment and recreation purposes in the downtown district to create a walkable, vibrant city core. Parking conditions, location, and access is a critical piece of the success of these investments. With the planned redevelopment of 20 Federal to include 80 market rate apartments, 57,000 sq.ft. of office space, and 20,000 sq.ft. of retail space, the viability of future occupancy is heavily dependent on secure, dedicated parking access. 20 Federal sits at the center of a fully-developed block which includes three additional buildings all connected by a set of interior hallways. This block of underutilized buildings equals approximately 540,000 sq.ft. of planned mixed-use redevelopment; almost all are facing the same obstacles to leasing without adequate and convenient parking. The buildings downtown that are consistently leased to capacity have one thing in common: dedicated and easily accessible parking. Uncertain parking access is an often-cited concern of visitors from suburban locations; a Commerce St. deck would be central to retail and entertainment venues. YSU's campus is adjacent to the proposed parking deck location. The OA Financial Feasibility study could explore a partnership with YSU for overflow parking, bringing students directly to downtown business activities to further support commercial and retail establishments.

Project Information

4. Proposed Projects (list up to 3):

- I. **Name of Project, address:** City of Youngstown Parking Garage Financial Feasibility Study, Commerce Street, Youngstown, Ohio
- **Size in Sq Ft.:** 135,000
 - **Total anticipated financing need \$:** 11,000,000
 - **Financing identified/anticipated, list source and dollar amount or note 'None':**
Partial funds from the city as they expect to have capacity in the municipal debt service fund to support project financing for construction and initial operations of the Commerce Street Garage. The City anticipates replacement of short-term city debt with longer term revenue bonds following stabilization of garage operations.
 - **Project description (include url link if available):**
The OA supported Financial Feasibility Study would identify the details for a properly sized, economically feasible, and financially sustainable parking structure that serves the needs of multiple underperforming downtown buildings. Please follow Google link above for full project description provided in a PDF document.
https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1KJSm_AetI3adY9D0UAWqAhztZOLXldv?usp=sharing
 - **Community Impact (quantify / provide estimates):**
This project will create a tangible community impact by supporting the sustainability and viability of downtown mixed-use buildings which, in the case of city-owned and rent-subsidized 20 Federal, once successfully redeveloped will free currently obligated funds from the city's general fund for higher and better public uses. A parking deck on Commerce Street would substantially increase the marketability and competitiveness of several under-performing buildings. The 20 Federal Project, a previous recipient of OA funding, estimates the creation of 679 full time jobs over a two-year period through redevelopment and resulting retail (20,000sq.ft.), office (57,000 sq.ft.) and residential occupancy (94,000 sq.ft.). Once fully realized, the expected return on this investment averages \$4.5 million per year. The adjacent Chase Building (currently at 20% capacity) plans for 57% of the building, 72,000 sq.ft., to be office space, and the Dollar Bank Building (currently empty) proposes 23,000 sq.ft. for commercial space and 46,000 sq.ft. in office space. Supporting efforts to increase marketability for these buildings will result in a significant overall economic impact to existing and planned downtown small businesses and to the city. Mixed use development is an economic driver in business districts, generating employment and around-the-clock activity to support restaurants, retail, and service oriented small businesses dependent on a robust workforce and a growing residential population. The economic impact of this block of buildings increasing market viability and capturing leases from the growth emerging from investments made at YSU, Youngstown Business Incubator, and other Industry 4.0 public/private partnerships would make a significant difference to the entire downtown economy. The OA study will determine financial sustainability, but information received from commercial realtors indicates that without dedicated parking for visitors, employees, and residents, the buildings are at a severe disadvantage to suburban locations. The need to support the proposed redevelopment of this block of buildings with parking is critical for continued economic development of downtown Youngstown, especially as businesses try to recover from two years of pandemic downturns.
 - **Name(s) of project sponsors, developer, and/or business owner, if identified:** City of Youngstown

- **Technical Assistance Needed:**

The City of Youngstown has engaged services that produced downtown parking analysis and studies including a Parking Garage Design Study specifically targeted at the Commerce Street location. The City is at the point where the guidance and assistance of the Appalachian Regional Commission is needed for a Parking Garage Financial Feasibility Study which will test the design and cost assumptions of the existing Parking Garage Design Study (portions of which are included in the URL linked document), in identifying the market for off-street parking to meet the demand identified by the existing Parking Garage Design Study, and determine the financial feasibility and sustainability of developing a market-supported parking structure on Commerce Street.

This will include TA in determining the path forward for capital access, structuring future ownership (public/private partnerships), and all assessments identified in the work plan including:

1. Confirm the existing and future demand for parking and its availability in the proposed garage site, both for the 20 Federal project and the adjacent under-served buildings (the Chase Building, Wick Towers, and 16 Wick Avenue);
2. Determine the ideal number of spaces for the subject parking garage;
3. Identify the parking rates to be charged at the facility and the fare collection technology to be employed;
4. Develop a workable operating plan for the garage including an estimate of the probable operating expenses for the facility,
5. Prepare a 10-year operating pro forma for the proposed garage,
6. Propose Sources and Uses of capital funds available for the construction of the garage, and
7. Explore feasibility of complementary uses to support clean energy and green water retention options.

The City has identified a preferable TA provider firm. The firm will submit the required RFQ form to OA before the application deadline.

- **Describe the connection to other proposed projects listed on this form (if applicable):** N/A

5. **Clean Energy Focus:** In the proposed Work Plan, Item 5 is "Complimentary Use Analysis" which states: The Commerce Street site for the proposed garage is located between the downtown central business district and the campus of Youngstown State University. There is a 40-foot change in elevation between downtown district and the campus district. Consultant will identify opportunities for incorporating vertical circulation and accessible walkways in the garage to meet the access needs of pedestrians, bikes, scooters, and those with challenged or limited mobility who seek to travel unimpeded between the two districts. Consultant will also explore the feasibility of incorporating roof-top solar panels and electric vehicle recharging stations, and will consider the cost/benefit of on-site water retention through green infrastructure methods." The Mahoning Valley is branded the "Voltage Valley" due to multiple battery storage/EV manufacturing investments including the \$2.3 billion Ultium Cells battery cell plant. The development of a new parking deck in Voltage Valley creates the opportunity for a demonstration project to test the practical applications of a closed loop on-site solar-generation- to-car-charging project. Car-port style solar generating structures on parking deck roofs have been a successful design standard in other areas of the country, and should be explored locally. With technologies and know-how becoming prominent in the region, this proposed clean energy project would garner regional and state interest and support.

6. **Applicant Capacity:** What is the relationship of the applicant to the community? How has the community demonstrated its support of the project(s)? Describe the applicant's role and capacity for completing or overseeing project activities: The applicant is the City of Youngstown. With current city-sponsored projects in the tens of millions of dollars, the applicant's capacity for overseeing the activities requested in this grant opportunity is strong. In addition, Youngstown city administration has contracted with YSU to work with grant writing and grant administration of awarded projects; if the city needs help in oversight with this project a contract is in place to provide that additional support. Youngstown is also the recipient of a previous OA award (for the 20 Federal redevelopment project) and has successfully completed that project with the identification of and contract with a redevelopment firm after a very satisfactory project period with an OA identified TA support consultant. Support of the project is displayed in the City adopted 2015 Downtown Vision and Action Plan, which under Initiative 6 of the Plan states that "accessible and convenient parking is necessary for economic development" and establishes as an objective for its Parking Management Initiative "connecting the downtown and YSU campus through a well-lit, maintained, welcoming and centralized parking option for users of downtown and the campus in order to avoid demolition for surface parking." The Plan calls for preparing a feasibility study for shared parking facilities to serve both the downtown and the university. The proposed feasibility study for the Commerce Street garage located between the campus and the downtown addresses the Plan's objectives. Eastgate Regional Council of Government's CEDS lists relevant objectives such as the need to encourage the support of mixed-use developments, and to encourage investments in downtown cores. The narrative for mixed-use, central city redevelopment projects is strong in local (CEDS Youngstown 2010, YSU Strategic Plan) and regional (Northeast Ohio Sustainable Communities Consortium Initiative) planning documents. Mixed-use projects are proven game-changing agents for central city redevelopment, and a key component to the success of central city redevelopment is adequate, accessible, safe parking structures.